THE INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF BUSINESS & MANAGEMENT

Brick and Mortar Shopping Enjoyment: Investigating Antecedents and Consequences of Retail Pleasure Experiences on Indonesian Generation Y

Mauren Elisabeth Maningkas

Assistant Manager, Department of Marketing, Bina Nusantara University, Indonesia

Jessica Azali

Shout Caster, Department of Gaming Industry, Bina Nusantara University, Indonesia

Jessica Salim

Entrepreneur, Owner of the Ohana Bakery, Bina Nusantara University, Indonesia

Dr. Roozbeh Babolian Hendijani

Lecturer, Department of Research, Publication, Bina Nusantara University, Indonesia

Abstract:

This paper researches the level of shopping value on Generation Y in Jakarta regarding retail environment effects towards retail pleasure experience. This study aims to help the fashion retailers in Jakarta to develop good atmospheres in the retail stores in order to attract the consumers to visit the retail stores. Constantly, the study is supported by quantitative methodology using valid questionnaires to 155 respondents. The questionnaires measure the level of shopping value on Generation Y in Jakarta regarding retail environment effects on retail pleasure experience. The online questionnaires consisting of nine sections (music, color, layout, lighting, familiarity, comfort, hedonic value, utilitarian value, and socio-demographic factors). The findings from the survey exposed that not all atmospheric elements in retail stores giving significant effect to the consumers comfort. The atmospheric elements that influence the consumers comfort the most are lighting and layout. While comfort and familiarity of the consumers may impact the shopping value. Moreover, this study can help the fashion retailers in Jakarta to develop their branding strategies by designing good retail environment that applied the standardized atmospheric elements that will give positive effect to shopping value and engage more consumers. As the conclusion, this study extends from the previous study about how atmospheric elements could influence the consumers comfort.

Keywords: Consumer comfort, consumer behavior, fashion industry, Indonesian generation y, retail atmosphere, shopping value

1. Introduction

Fashion is everywhere. Fashion can occur in any field, from academic theory to furniture design to dance styles. From the first animal skin body coverings to today's high fashion collections, fashion has played an important role in the evolution of mankind. Fashion is not merely clothes, nor is it just a collection of images. Rather, it is a vibrant form of visual and material culture that plays an important role in social and cultural life. However, it is generally taken, especially in its singular form, to refer to fashions in clothing.

Fashion industry has made, and continues to make, major contributions to our cultural and social environment. It is a fast paced, complex, and ever changing, in response to consumer needs. A vast, international fashion industry has developed since the renaissance. Fashion is usually thought to have started in this period, as a product of developments in trade and finance. By the later 17th century, the development of fashion magazines, made fashion increasingly visible and desirable. The first French fashion magazine, *Mercure Galant*, is published in 1672 and helps promote French fashion throughout Europe and the New World. Fashion's pace began to speed up by the later 18th century at the time of the Enlightenment. England has become the leader through Europe for male fashion and French dominate in womens wear.

Around 19th century, lots of inventions were made and new trends emerged. Joseph Courts introduced tape measurement, Barthélemy Thimmonier invented a chain stitch sewing machine, Walter Hunt invented safety pin and lockstitch sewing machine. In 1848, A.T. Stewart & Co. known as 'The Marble Palace', the largest department store in the world at the time, was founded in Manhattan by Alexander Turney Stewart. Harper's Bazaar first published in New York and Paris at 1867, and Vogue is founded in New York at 1892.

The industry continued its evolution in 20th century. Streets on the Lower East Siden began to set up serious businesses. Coco channel opens her millinery shop in 1910, Mario Prada opened his leather goods business in 1913, Elle is founded in 1945. Change continues to come. Garments are conceived, illustrated, and laser-cut by computers, and replenished automatically by a store's data system alerts.

Fashion industry is unique on its own way, growing and evolving really fast. 'In just over 160 years the business complexity increased from the one-man company, dominated by the artisan tailor to a multinational corporation – still keeping the same essential work steps, but spreading them over different departments, locations, countries and continents.' (Hilger, 2008). Fashion industry is a global player industry that exists to deliver the demand of ready-to-wear clothes and to determine the trend of what's next to wear. This industry cope to all business or individual who expertise in designing, producing, and distributing all the things people wear, including belt, shoes, gown, suit, hat, jacket, pants, necklace, swimsuit, t-shirt, and all of other clothes type or accessories that people usually buy. According to Gereffi (2005) 'International retailers of clothing are believed to be the key drivers of the globalization of the clothing industry'.

Fashion awareness of the society leads to lifestyle fulfillment of clothing. Thus, clothing is not only about covering the body, it is also a statement of personal interests and lifestyle. The importance of clothing is undeniable. Clothing offers comfort and protection, and it allows society to express their personalities. Fashion industry has become one of the major sectors in the global economy which provide jobs for billions of people around the world. Its growth continues until now, including in Indonesia.

The rapid development of retail industry in Indonesia is an interesting thing. Although technological developments have progressed and the internet has increasingly dominated society's activities, online activities will never completely replace offline experiences. Many retail industries have implemented a digitalized system, but the brick and mortar system (offline business) will still be in demand. The growing development of the retail industry at this time provides many choices for consumers to determine which brands to buy and which products in shopping places are considered to have the convenience of shopping in accordance with consumer desires. The number of retail choices at this time makes entrepreneurs to pay more attention to consumers' perceptions so that the retail that will or has been built into a retail choice of many consumers so that it can bring in many consumers and later will also bring profits to the business.

Indonesia with a population of around 260 million is a potential market for modern retail businesses. Especially for retail fashion. At present, fashion retailers in Indonesia are becoming more competitive. People can find many retail stores in any places. Malls and departments stores increase in quantity, almost every province has one or more. Local designers work hardly to compete with international brands. Local fashions are becoming more dynamic, not only in price range but also in quality and design varieties. International retailers made more choices for consumers to choose. Every store usually changes their collection by seasons every 4-6 months to give a different variety. In every change, there will be some new products in stores. The products will be divided equally to all the outlets. The collection comes to the capital city, Jakarta, and then spreads to nearby cities. That makes Jakarta a role model to other cities, supported by their consumers high purchasing power and equipped facilities.

In Indonesia there are variety fashion that consumer can find. They have their own point of view about happening trends. The way people choose their fashions are mostly driven by their view on sexuality, loyalty, political view, sub-cultural and most of the time, to represent their feelings. This is an obvious point that Indonesian fashion will keep on evolving in the future.

Eastman and Liu (2012) and Parment (2013) explained that 'Generation Ys are independent, self-sufficient, and have a high level of spending power' (as cited in Ladhari, Gonthier, & Lajante, 2019). Generation Y have a characteristic to be a disloyal consumer, take interest in innovators (early adopters) who are courageous to try new things in terms of products and services, and also, they are likely to be exposed in social. This would be one of the reasons that they are high spenders in clothing retail store. Moreover, there are different ways clothing industry can offer their products such as online application, mobile, or in a retail store.

These days, retail stores are fighting back with online and mobile stores to retain their consumers. Retail stores still have lots of advantages compared to online or mobile, as written by Gallino and Moreno (2018), 'Offline-first retailers can transform stores into experience centers where consumers can engage meaningfully with the retailer, making the store not only a place to fulfil orders but also a destination'. Through offline experience, consumers learn more about the retailer and the products. Retailers also have the opportunity to observe study, and learn about their consumers including their emotional and sensory response to products, salespeople, and in-store stimuli.

In offline store consumers can do physical interaction like fitting the clothes, compare the clothes design, can see and touch the clothing material and structure as well while the other two cannot. They are exposed to the brand in a more meaningful and immersive way, and they are better able to resolve any uncertainty about the nondigital attributes of the retailer's products. Moreover, they can get influenced with comfort of the retail environment. Daniels (2000), Simmons (2001), and Spake et al., (2003) stated that 'psychological comfort represents a sense of ease that facilitates calm and worry-free feelings within an environment' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). Previous study from Ainsworth (2017) also state that 'layout and familiarity significantly influence comfort, and in-turn, comfort influences utilitarian and hedonic value'. By creating comfort to consumers will influence positive emotional and functional role for them to increase the shopping value in retail stores.

According to Parment (2011), Generation Y individuals put little effort, emotions and time into low-involvement decisions, such as the choice of electricity or home insurance supplier, but a lot of effort, energy and emotions into high-involvement decisions. It is important to understand different behaviour of Generation Y on dealing in the retails. The level of buying involvement on fashion is hardly to be understood but young generation such as Generation Y are more attracted in fashion.

Generation Y is different with Baby Boomers. Baby Boomers prefer to 'make perfect' on buying decisions. For example, Baby Boomers choose the best qualities of the products and select clothing that can be matched with the remain

clothing that has been purchased before. They trust and loyal to one store's brand because of the tendency on their feeling. While, Generation Y search for best deal in the stores.

Understanding the different generations affect to the fashion retails. As an offline store, retails' brand needs to understand the shopping values of the consumers. According to the Grewal *et al.* (2009); Grewal *et al.* (2017), retailers must have strategies to influence the shoppers by increase its value proposition on understand, assist and how to influence the shopper behavior. 'Retailers must battle for relevance by engendering consumer engagement through amazing consumer experiences, emotional connections, and shared identity' (Grewal *et al.*, 2009).

It is important for the fashion retails to improve the value to attract and engage the consumers to be loyal. Nowadays, there are lots of new fashion retails stores especially for local clothing stores in Jakarta that consider the use of physical retail environment such as: Love and Flair, Love Bonito, Project X, The Goods Dept and etc. The clothing retail stores show their value to engage the target market, from their concept and environment that described by the colour, layout, and lighting in the store.

Fashion retail stores in Indonesia are not just filled by local brands, international retail brand also present and highly influence the trends. The international retail stores that we can easily find in Indonesia, especially Jakarta, are Bershka, H&M, Mango, Pull&Bear, Stradivarius, Zara, and etc. Most of these fashion retails stores want to keep their consumers attached especially Generation Y.

As an emerging market, Generation Y has been of interest in recent times (e.g. Bakewell and Mitchell, 2003; Bakewell *et al.*, 2006). According to Der Honavesian (1999); Gardyn (2002); Ma and Niehm (2006), Generation Y has good spending power, most of the time they spend carelessly in their spare times, they also prefer to choose more spacious layouts and they easily adapts and responsive with the changes of fashion and the shopping environment. That is the reason to create the good shopping environment to attract these Generation Y through the design of the fashion retail. The study before examined the consumer comfort in the retail atmospherics which is still limited to music, layout, colour, and familiarity. As the results, in this study the focus in fashion retails' atmospheric factors (music, layout, colour, and lighting) will impact the comfort of Generation Y's when they shop in the offline retail stores.

Therefore, the purpose of the study is to find out if these psychological comforts is influenced by its retail environment, and to answer the research questions of the study: 1) How the atmospheric elements (music, color, layout and lighting) and familiarity influence the consumers' comfort of these Generation Y? 2) How does the consumers comfort affect the hedonic and utilitarian value?

Findings of this study will give benefits to the researchers as the findings of behavior of Indonesian Generation Y consumers through the shopping experiences in the retail stores. In aspects of practical for the businesses could improve the retail designs by understanding the importance of atmospheric elements in order to attract and retain the consumers.

2. Literature Review

2.1. Psychological Comfort in the Retail Environment

According to Bitner (1992); Kotler (1973), 'Research study of the retail atmospherics explores the role of the environmental design elements on consumer behavior at the psychological level' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). 'Atmosphere is a term that is used to explain our feelings towards the shopping experience which cannot be seen' (Milliman, 1986). Kotler (1973-74) describes the atmosphere as 'the design of the of retail chain outlet that produces specific emotional effects on the buyer that enhances his purchasing probability'. The attractive and impressive atmosphere of retail chain outlets creates an enjoyable experience among the consumers, which directly affects consumers' purchase intention and their decision-making process (Srinivasan & Srivastava, 2010)

Wakefield & Baker (1998) proved that the probability of consumers staying longer in store increases due to atmospheric stimulus. Bohl (2012) stated that, 'when consumers feel comfort from the retail environment of the store, they spend more time in a particular store and buy more because of pleasant environmental stimuli' (as cited in Hussain & Ali, 2015). 'The environment has a huge impact on the consumers' emotion and satisfaction. The impressive atmosphere of the retail chain outlets enhances the consumer satisfaction level and purchase experience' (Silva & Giraldi, 2010).

The store's atmosphere has a big influence on the evaluation and behaviour of consumers. Understanding the retail settings and environment could support Generation Y as consumers to increase positive attitude towards shopping enjoyment in retail. The positive mood and attitudes created by shopping enjoyment or in the other words shopping comfort could increase the shopping values created in Generation Y. Moreover, it is possible to give new insight of settings in retail to gain the shopping enjoyment that Generation Y were expecting in retails. Shopping values that offered by retails toward Generation Y consumers is align with the profit produced by the retails.

Spake *et al.* (2003) stated that, 'psychological comfort, on the other hand represents a psychological state where individuals feel at ease, calm, and worry-free while present in an environment' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). Psychological comfort is usually determined by the psychological state of the person who is worried, who is calm or even when they are not worried when they are in the environment. Consumers consider comfort as a crucial issue, for example physical and psychological factors that affect them when in the retail environment, because the results further also show that comfort is one of the most important factors that contribute to the consumer's view of retail attractiveness.

Studies and concepts about psychological comfort has got some spotlight in some areas of marketing. Stern (1997) mentioned that 'within the advertising domain, psycho- logical comfort with a brand, product, place, service or event can be conveyed in advertising messages through images of physical comfort' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). While, according to Sheth and Paratlyar (1995), 'in most behaviour researches, most of the researchers use psychological comfort to define the behavior of consumers when they meet difficult purchase condition which the comfort usually acts as a factor that help

the consumers reduce perceived complexity' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). As a result, working on these concepts and studies of psychological comfort in retail shopping enjoyment is an interesting scope to be learned.

2.2. Utilitarian and Hedonic Shopping Value

According to Tauber (1972), 'shoppers are not only motivated by the potential purchase of product, but also by the satisfaction that can be gained from the shopping experience' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). 'In fact, marketers today tend to consider shopping to be a multisensory 'experience' rather than a simple acquisition task' (Foster and McLelland, 2015). Moreover, according to Babin *et al.* (1994), 'As such consumers are predicted to derive certain benefits from both the utility and experiential-based aspects of the shopping journey' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017) and 'not surprisingly, the consideration of utilitarian and hedonic shopping value has been a common approach in the retailing literature' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). Align with the conventions, both utilitarian and hedonic shopping value are checked and analysis separately below.

According to Jones *et al.* (2006), 'utilitarian shopping value is task-oriented and is not an emotional factor' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). 'It pertains to task-related benefits obtained through shopping and can be derived from particular design cues' (Baker *et al.*, 2002). However, according to Babin *et al.* (1994, 653), 'not all shopping behaviour is straightly direct just to satisfied on the functional factor, physical factor, or economic need'.

Hedonic value reflects the affective benefits gained from positive feelings experienced through the shopping trip. According to Arnold and Reynolds (2003), 'It can be derived during planned shopping behaviour as well as impulsive shopping behaviours'. For that reason, the study will evaluate the influence of shopping enjoyment occurred in Generation Y to both utilitarian and hedonic shopping value. In the retail, the social interactions are very important and crucial for attract consumers to come into the retail. For example, how the consumers can find the information of the products to accomplish their needs (utilitarian) and how the retail settings can attract the consumers to buy the products (hedonic).

2.3. Relationship between Familiarity and Comfort

According to Edwards *et al.* (2009), 'Familiarity is a derived cue which typically describes the presence of knowledge structures about a specific target that are built over time through one's experiences with the target'. According to Yang, Zhang and Zou (2015) brand familiarity is the degree of understanding about the brand accumulated in the consumers' memory after contacting and experience the brand (as cited in Maziriri, 2017). Claypool *et al.*, (2008) stated that 'amongst social and cognitive psychology research, evidence that familiarity with a stimulus elicits positive reactions is prolific' However, there are less research on familiarity in marketing area. Therefore, studying and examining the role of retail familiarity on Generation Y's behaviour in Jakarta appears to be an under-researched area yet it is very interesting to be explored.

2.4. Impact of Non-Social Atmospheric Elements on Comfort

According to Luo (2005); Rook and Fisher (1995); Yi-Hsiu and Chen-Yueh (2012), 'the consumers' shopping behavior in retails is influenced by the retail's environment such as how the retails' normative influences, how is the social interactions inside the retail, and how is the interpersonal influences' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). Furthermore, most of many retails especially in fashion clothing retails in Jakarta, they do not have many human resources who can provide the social interactions that can completely fill the journey of the experiences of the consumers when they shop. Consequently, the study will target on non-social atmospheric elements' impact to the consumer comforts.

According to Baker *et al.* (1994); Kotler (1973), 'the non-social atmospheric elements consist of the aspects and characteristics of the environment in the retails' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). Existing study has discussed that distinct atmospheric elements will influence the shopper behavior. From some of literatures, 'three studies persistently described-music' (Mattila and Wirtz, 2008; Turley and Milliman, 2000), 'color' (Bellizzi *et al.*, 1992 as cited in Ainsworth, 2017), and 'store layout' (Turley and Chebat, 2002; Vrechopoulos *et al.*, 2004) and 'lighting' (Areni & Kim, 1994; Baker, Grewal & Parasuraman, 1994; Baker, Levy, & Grewal, 1992, as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). As each of these four atmosphere elements that are crucial in the retails that will impact to the consumers' purchase behaviour, this study will discuss the four factors of atmospheric elements on how they affect to the consumers' comfort by consider the retail settings.

2.4.1. Impact of Color towards Consumer Comfort

According to Cheng *et al.* (2009), to design aspiring and interesting shopping atmosphere, most of the retails will concern on the use of color elements in the retails. 'As one of key on creating good store's environment, color plays a significant role in influencing consumer perceptions.' (Bagchi and Cheema, 2013; Labrecque and Milne, 2012) and according to Gorn *et al.* (1997), 'the consumers' attitudes, their belief and behavior can be influenced by the color as one of the key atmosphere elements' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). According to Cheng *et al.* (2009), this color can be divided into three parts such as hue (color), value (shade) and chroma (density) which has effects on the consumer behavior. In this study, the focus will be examined the consumers' attitude on the using of color as designing atmosphere in the retail environment. Therefore, based on the existing research that discussed about the positive effects of color which this element can influence positively to the consumers' comfort through the retail setting.

- H1: Color Has Significant And Positive Effect Towards Consumer Comfort In The Retail Stores

2.4.2. Impact of Layout towards Consumer Comfort

According to Vrechopoulos *et al.* (2004), 'a good-designed of layout in the retails can give good impact to the store atmosphere, patterns of traffic and operational efficiency'. The layout design can influence the consumers behaviour for

example, bad layout can affect the consumers feel the space is too big or too small, difficult to find the products and even affect the security of the consumers inside the retail. As the conclusion according to Vrechopoulos *et al.* (2004), layout plays a significant role on creating a picture of the retail in the consumers' minds. Thus, the good layout will influence the positive effect of consumers comfort in the retail.

- H2: Layout has significant and positive effect towards consumer comfort in the retail stores

2.4.3. Impact of Music towards Consumer Comfort

According to Cheng *et al.* (2009); Chebat *et al.* (2001); Eroglu *et al.* (2005); Turley and Milliman (2000), 'consumers emotion and behavior is influenced by music'. For example, the background music in the retails usually affects the joyful feeling of consumers. The music also affects to the attitude of the consumers and the staffs in the stores. According to Fashu and Kang (2019), 'the 'fit' music can help to build and encourage consumers' view and behavior in the stores because it affects the consumers mood such as joyful and also satisfaction to the retail.' As a result, music can lead into certain emotions, beliefs, and changes on psychological of the people. Same with color and layout, the study will also discuss the impact of the music on the consumer's comfort in the retail.

- H3: Layout has significant and positive effect towards consumer comfort in the retail stores

2.4.4. Impact of Lighting towards Consumer Comfort

According to Rea and Illuminating Engineering Society of North America (2000); Boyce and Raynham (2009), 'the prior objective of lighting in the retail is to offer the ambience on brightness, attract the attention to the products, and highlight the products too because factors such as the arrangement of lighting, level of brightness, uniformity and contrast are crucial to be examined in retail.' According to Areni and Kim (1994); Baker, Grewal and Parasuraman (1994); Baker, Levy, and Grewal (1992), 'lighting is important part in creating a positive store image, helping to evaluate the products and even one of retail environment factors that attract consumers to purchase the products' (as cited in Ainsworth, 2017). According to Summers and Hebert (2001), engaging retails may direct consumers to come in, put in their time, and even attract them to buy something in the retail. Quartier, Vanrie and Cleempoel (2014) stated that 'lighting could enhance the ambience in the retail by the atmospheres that created to give the unique retail experiences to the consumers.' In addition, Schielke and Leudesdorff (2015) explained that 'the study about lighting also stated that store types and lighting arrangements could affect a store's brand image in which that decorating lighting.'

- H4: Layout has significant and positive effect towards consumer comfort in the retail stores

2.5. Impact of Familiarity on Comfort and Shopping Value

In addition to the atmospheric variables, the perceived familiarity of the environment is examined as an influence over consumer comfort within a retail setting. 'Unlike music, color, and layout, familiarity is derived environmental cue that relies on a sense of similarity between the current stimulus and cues from previous experiences' (DeCarlo *et al.*, 2007). While consumer interactions usually occur within familiar settings, some studies have investigated the influence of familiar retail settings on consumer behavior. This is relevant, given the popularity in retailing to use flexible design elements that are changed or updated often. But sometimes, that constant change could have a negative impact on the consumer's sense of comfort. In the future a better understanding of the relationship between familiarity and comfort is needed. That will provide a more complete information on which to base store design decisions to retail managers. While the role of familiarity in evoking positive retail responses is under-researched, there are some intuitive links between familiarity and psychological comfort.

Notably, as consumers hold prior knowledge about the environment for familiar settings, familiarity should provide processing fluency – the ease with which information can be processed (Janiszewski *et al.*, 2013) by requiring little additional processing to understand the environment.

This process of fluency should act as an information management system for perceptual information helping to reduce uncertainty and prevent anxiety within the retail setting. In addition, the vast amount of research on the mere exposure effect – Ainsworth (2017) explains 'why, when everything else kept equal, people tend to like things that are more familiar to them – suggests that as consumers obtain greater familiarity with an environment, they also become more comfortable in the space. Yet, this relationship has not been directly explored in the retailing literature. Consequently, familiarity should increase comfort, as stated in hypothesis five:

- H5: Familiarity has significant and positive effect towards consumer comfort in the retail stores

2.6. Impact of Familiarity and Consumer Comfort in Shopping Value

The most important outcome of shopping experience is the value itself; this can be determined in the retail settings. Shopping value is important in order to measures the consumer behaviour. By acknowledge their behavior would help retail stores to put more effort into their retail setting to gain more consumers shopping experience. Behavioral measures are the initial studies as more general measures can be inferred to extend broader set of behavioral outcomes (e.g.: consumers return intention, consumer re-purchase intention, etc.). Shopping value as mentioned previously consists of hedonic and utilitarian value. On the other hand, Albayrak, Caber, and Comen (2016) mentioned that each shopping attribute has a varying impact on value dimensions, which could further affect behavioral intentions. Ainsworth (2017) explained 'hedonic component is gained from the experiential, emotional and fantasy aspect of the experience, while utilitarian is gained from efficient manner the purchase of products was made.' Ainsworth (2017) also stated 'comfort and familiarity are related constructs'. Increasing familiarity could increase consumer comfort which leads to influence positive attitudes towards shopping value.

In this study predicts that familiarity would increase the shopping value in the retail stores. By being familiar towards certain retail store, could increase the value of efficiency in shopping which is utilitarian value. Clothing retail store familiarity acting as the independent variable while the shopping values acting as the dependent variable.

- H6: Familiarity has significant and positive effect towards hedonic shopping value
- H7: Familiarity has significant and positive effect towards utilitarian shopping value
- Moreover, this study expects that consumer comfort would increase the shopping value in the retail stores. 'Comfort making consumer feels relaxed and safe to be inside the retail stores to shop' (Ainsworth, 2017)
- H8: Consumer comfort has significant and positive effect towards hedonic shopping value
- H9: Consumer comfort has significant and positive effect towards utilitarian shopping value

Figure 1: Framework Model of Retail Environment Affects Shopping Value

3. Methodology

To measure the level of shopping value of Generation Y in Jakarta regarding retail environment effects on retail pleasure experience, online questionnaires consisting of nine sections (music, color, layout, lighting, familiarity, comfort, hedonic value, utilitarian value, and socio-demographic factors) were distributed randomly to Generation Y population who always shop in several middle high range fashion retail in Jakarta. All of the respondents were selected in Jakarta, Indonesia because there are lots of shopping malls with middle high fashion retails. This research applied a convenience sampling method.

The questionnaire was established and developed based on a recapitulation of previous literature and was modified by the researchers by adopting from literature reviews and adjusted for content validity. The first until fifth section of the questionnaires consisted of 26 questions and measured various conditions and aspects of experience related to retail environment (color, music, layout, lighting, familiarity) using a five-point Likert scale (1 strongly disagree to 5 strongly agree). The questions in these sections were based on previous research (Ainsworth & Foster, 2017; Summers & Hebert, 2001). The sixth section consisted of 5 questions that measured the overall comfort shopping experience of the Generation Y in Jakarta (Ainsworth & Foster, 2017). The seventh and eighth section of the survey consisted of 6 questions that measured the aspects of shopping value in hedonic and utilitarian value. The ninth part of the survey consisted of 6 questions relevant to the socio-demographic characteristics of the respondents (gender, marital status, level of education, occupation, spending, and income level) and their frequency of shopping in fashion retail.

In order to ensure the reliability and validity of the questionnaire, a pilot test was conducted by applying it to 33 randomly selected Generation Y. After running a statistical reliability test of Cronbach's alpha, it was found that the instrument had a reliability factor above 0.7 (Nunnally & Bernstein, 1994). Data were collected from July to August 2019. After removing incomplete sets of questionnaires, 155 (99,35%) valid questionnaires were used to analyze. In addition to the usual descriptive analysis of means, standard deviations and frequencies, multiple linear regression was conducted. All data processing was conducted using SPSS version 22.0 (SPSS, Inc., Chicago, IL) to resolve the objectives of this study.

4. Results and Findings

Based on the questionnaires that being spread into Generation Y living in Jakarta, majority of respondents were female N=101 (65,2%). In terms of marital status majority of them were single N=127(82,5%), had bachelor degree N=122 (79,2%). In terms of occupation, most of the respondents had private job N=70 (45,5%) which has most monthly income range between 5.000.001-10.000.000 N=61 (39,6%). 135 Generation Y (87,7%) spend below 3,5 million rupiah per months on clothing products. The shopping frequency are mostly they shop in anytime is needed N=90 (58,4).

4.1. Impact of Non-Social Atmospheric Elements on Comfort

H1 to H4 described the effect of the atmospheric elements have impact to the consumers' comfort. These hypotheses were supported by several previous studies which shows that the retails atmosphere is crucial on creating consumers' response through the environment. Though, from 4 of non-social atmospheric elements that have been tested, only two elements have significant effects on the comfort of the consumers in the retail as shown in table 1. The two elements were layout which has significant effect on comfort ($\beta = .253$, $p = .010$) and lighting which also has significant effect on the comfort ($\beta = .209$, $p = .021$). While rest of the atmospheric elements such as music and color did not have significant effect towards the consumers' comfort.

Dependent Variable	Independent Variable	R Square	B coefficient	Significant
Comfort	Color	.365	.116	.218
	Layout		.253	.010
	Music		.057	.500
	Lighting		.209	.021
	Familiarity		.116	.132

Table 1: Result of Regression Analysis Retail Environment to Comfort

4.2. Impact of Familiarity on Comfort and Shopping Value

H5 predicted that consumer comfort would increase as the perception of familiarity within the setting increased. But in this study shows a different result, familiarity has no positive effect on comfort ($\beta = .116$, $\rho = .132$). Their result was only layout and lighting had positive effect on comfort, thus H5 was not supported as being shown in table 1.

4.3. Impact of Familiarity on Shopping Value

H6 predicted that familiarity has significant effect towards hedonic shopping value. Familiarity had a significant effect of 8,2% towards hedonic shopping value, and also familiarity had a positive effect on hedonic shopping value ($\beta = .286$, $\rho = .000$) as shown in table 2.

H7 predicted that familiarity has significant effect towards utilitarian shopping value. Familiarity had a significant effect of 21,4% towards utilitarian shopping value, and also familiarity had a positive effect on utilitarian shopping value ($\beta = .462$, $\rho = .000$) as shown in table 3.

Dependent Variable	Independent Variable	R Square	B coefficient	Significant
Hedonic Value	Comfort	.096	.310	.000
	Familiarity	.082	.286	.000

Table 2: Result of Regression Analysis Retail Comfort and Familiarity to Hedonic Value

4.4. Impact of Consumer Comfort on Shopping Value

H8 predicted that comfort has significant effect towards hedonic shopping value. Comfort had a significant effect of 9,6% towards hedonic shopping value, and also comfort had a positive effect on hedonic value ($\beta = .310$, $\rho = .000$) as shown in table 2.

H9 predicted that comfort has significant effect towards utilitarian shopping value. Comfort had a significant effect of 14,1% towards utilitarian shopping value, and also comfort had a positive effect on utilitarian value ($\beta = .376$, $\rho = .000$) as shown in table 3.

Dependent Variable	Independent Variable	R Square	B coefficient	Significant
Utilitarian Value	Comfort	.141	.376	.000
	Familiarity	.214	.462	.000

Table 3: Result of Regression Analysis Retail Comfort and Familiarity to Utilitarian Value

5. Discussions and Conclusions

5.1. Atmospheric Antecedents of Comfort

Atmospheric elements such as music, layout, color, and lighting were examined as antecedents that influence the consumers comfort. Though, the results show that the elements that have significant effects on the consumers comfort is just layout and lighting. While the other elements such as Music and Color have not significant effect on the comfort. This result is supported by previous study (Ainsworth & Foster, 2017). 'Retail environment comfort results from an evaluation of the task-relevant dimensions which is the aspects of the retail design that directly affect how the consumers interact with the environment.' (Ainsworth & Ballantine, 2014). Respectively, layout and lighting have significant effect to the comfort because these two factors have close relationship with task-relevant behaviors. For consumers, layout is very crucial when they want to buy or purchase something in the retails. The other factors such as lighting is also critical for consumers to looking for good quality of the goods or even helpful on purchase or looking at the goods. As the result, we can conclude that the task-relevancy of environmental elements usually has a significant impact on the creating the comfort.

5.2. The Impact of Familiarity on Consumers Comfort

The result shows familiarity has no significant and positive effect on comfort as in H5. It's different from the previous study. Ainsworth and Foster (2017) research stated that 'familiarity of the environment positively impacts on the

comfort'. This fashion retail and Generation Y research in Indonesia, they got a different result. Familiarity of the environment not positively impacts on the comfort reported by consumers, not supporting the prediction that consumers experience a sense of ease when shopping. More precisely, layout and lighting factor has an impact on the comfort of Indonesian shoppers. These researches show different result. In addition, result shows familiarity having a positive impact of familiarity on utilitarian and hedonic value. Moreover, although comfort and familiarity are related constructs, the fact that familiarity leads indirectly (through comfort) to utilitarian value and hedonic demonstrates that comfort and familiarity have a distinct role in providing value for Generation Y in retail environments.

5.3. The Impact of Familiarity on Shopping Value

The result shows familiarity having significant effect towards both hedonic and utilitarian shopping value as predicted in H6 and H7. Thus, the familiarity having higher significant to utilitarian effect. 'Familiarity provides a sense of knowledge about the environment which helps direct in-store behavior and facilitates task efficiencies and completion' (Ainsworth & Foster, 2017) Therefore when Generation Y shop supported with familiarity, they already know and recognize which store to be visited. Being familiar to retail stores lead consumers especially Generation Y to shop things they needed easily. Consumers can experience easiness and efficiency when shopping in a familiar setting. Familiar environments support the emotional and functional benefits for shoppers. Therefore, there are several Generation Y who have familiarity effect to hedonic value. They are big spender in shopping, yet maybe not all they spend on clothing yet still being hedonic to clothing in retail stores.

5.4. The Impact of Comfort on Shopping Value

The result shows comfort having significant effect towards both hedonic and utilitarian shopping value as predicted in H6 and H7. Experiencing comfort in retail store boosts the shopping value especially in utilitarian value, and afterwards will take effect in hedonic value. When Generation Y feeling comfort in retail stores, they likely would to shop more than what they needed. After buying the utilitarian things, they could stay longer in the store to experience more inside. Supported by the retail environment especially layout and lighting could make consumers experience comfort ambience and lead them to increase their shopping values in both hedonic and utilitarian.

6. Limitations and Direction for Future Research

6.1. Theoretical and Managerial Implication

Based from the results above, this study will extend the theory from previous research by adding new variable which is lighting. Then, this study also helps Indonesian clothing retail companies to increase their strategy to fight the mobile or online platform in attracting Indonesian Generation Y as their target market. There are some important keys of physical environment in the retail stores that can become standardized atmospheric that must have been in the retail such as layout and lighting elements which is crucial to the consumers. Those two elements will give positive effect to the Generation Y psychological comfort when they shop and increase their shopping value. Moreover, the study also giving idea for retail stores to retain their consumers by creating comfort to boost the shopping value in retail stores.

6.2. Limitation and Future Suggestion

This study limited the variables in atmospheric elements which are only for non-social elements. Yet, the retail environment is more complex than the elements listed above (color, layout, music, lighting). In future research, the study could extend by adding more variables in the non-social elements such as spatial, and smells inside the retail store. By examine spatial means the study research about how space could influence the comfort of the consumers and examine how smells could bring familiarity towards the consumers. Future research also could explore more in social elements such as service inside the retail stores. By examine how the consumers wanted the service to be in the retail stores in order to influence positive effect to consumers comfort.

In addition, this study limited to quantitative data collection. In order to explore and get more insights, the study can also enhance the data collection by conducting qualitative research. Talking about retail stores, there are various types. However, this study only limited to clothing fashion retail stores. Therefore, in the future researchers could change the type of retail stores such as food and beverage retail, cosmetic retail in Jakarta or other regional areas.

7. References

- i. Ailawadi, K.L., & Keller, K.L. (2004). Understanding retail branding: conceptual insights and research priorities. *Journal of Retailing*, 80(4), 331-342.
- ii. Ainsworth, J., & Ballantine, P.W. (2014). That's different! How consumers respond to retail website change. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 21(5), 764-772
- iii. Ainsworth, J., & balljoner, J. (2017). Comfort in brick and mortar shopping experiences: Examining antecedents and consequences of comfortable retail experiences. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 35, 27-35.
- iv. Albayrak, T., Caber, M., & Çömen, N. (2016). Tourist shopping: The relationships among shopping attributes, shopping value, and behavioral intention. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 18, 98-106.
- v. Areni, C.S., & Kim, D. (1994). The influence of in-store lighting on consumers' examination of merchandise in a wine store. *International Journal of Research in Marketing*, 11(2), 117-125.
- vi. Arnold, M.J., & Reynolds, K.E. (2003). Hedonic shopping motivations. *Journal of Retailing*, 79(2), 77-95.

- vii. Babin, B.J., Darden, W.R., & Griffin, M. (1994). Work and/or fun: Measuring hedonic and utilitarian shopping value. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 20(4), 644-656.
- viii. Babin, B.J., Lee, Y.K., Kim, E.J., & Griffin, M. (2005). Modeling consumer satisfaction and word-of-mouth: Restaurant patronage in Korea. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 19(3), 133-139.
- ix. Bagchi, R., & Cheema, A. (2012). The effect of red background color on willingness-to-pay: The moderating role of selling mechanism. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 39(5), 947-960.
- x. Baker, J., Parasuraman, A., Grewal, D., & Voss, G.B. (2002). The influence of multiple store environment cues on perceived merchandise value and patronage intentions. *Journal of Marketing*, 66(2), 120-141.
- xi. Bell, D.R., Gallino, S., & Moreno, A. (2018). The store is dead—Long live the store. *MIT Sloan Management Review*, 59, 59-66.
- xii. Bellizzi, J.A., & Hite, R.E. (1992). Environmental color, consumer feelings, and purchase likelihood. *Psychology & Marketing*, 9(5), 347-363.
- xiii. Bhuvaneshwari, K. J., & Krishnan, J. (2015). A review of literature on impulse buying behaviour of consumers in Brick & Mortar and click only stores. *International Journal of Management Research and Social Science*, 2(3), 84-90.
- xiv. Bitner, M.J. (1992). Servicescapes: The impact of physical surroundings on consumers and employees. *Journal of Marketing*, 56(2), 57-71.
- xv. Brown, L., Edwards, J., & Hartwell, H. (2010). A taste of the unfamiliar: Understanding the meanings attached to food by international postgraduate students in England. *Appetite*, 54(1), 202-207.
- xvi. Chebat, J.C., Chebat, C.G., & Vaillant, D. (2001). Environmental background music and in-store selling. *Journal of Business Research*, 54(2), 115-123.
- xvii. Chebat, J.C., Sirgy, M.J., & Grzeskowiak, S. (2010). How can shopping mall management best capture mall image? *Journal of Business Research*, 63(7), 735-740.
- xviii. Cheng, F.F., Wu, C.S., & Yen, D.C. (2009). The effect of online store atmosphere on consumer's emotional responses—an experimental study of music and colour. *Behaviour & Information Technology*, 28(4), 323-334.
- xix. Chinomona, E., & Maziriri, E.T. (2017). The influence of brand trust, brand familiarity and brand experience on brand attachment: A case of consumers in the Gauteng Province of South Africa. *Journal of Economics and Behavioral Studies*, 9(1), 69-81.
- xx. Claypool, H.M., Hall, C.E., Mackie, D.M., & Garcia-Marques, T. (2008). Positive mood, attribution, and the illusion of familiarity. *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology*, 44(3), 721-728.
- xxi. Donzé, P.Y., & Fujioka, R. (2015). European luxury big business and emerging Asian markets, 1960–2010. *Business History*, 57(6), 822-840.
- xxii. Eroglu, S.A., Machleit, K.A., & Davis, L.M. (2003). Empirical testing of a model of online store atmospherics and shopper responses. *Psychology & Marketing*, 20(2), 139-150.
- xxiii. Fashu, Y., & Kang, J. (2019). Effect of background and foreground music on satisfaction, behavior, and emotional responses in public spaces of shopping malls. *Applied Acoustics*, 145, 408-419.
- xxiv. Foster, J., & McLelland, M.A. (2015). Retail atmospherics: The impact of a brand dictated theme. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 22, 195-205.
- xxv. Gereffi, G., Humphrey, J., & Sturgeon, T. (2005). The governance of global value chains. *Review of International Political Economy*, 12(1), 78-104.
- xxvi. Gorn, G.J., Chattopadhyay, A., Yi, T., & Dahl, D.W. (1997). Effects of color as an executional cue in advertising: They're in the shade. *Management Science*, 43(10), 1387-1400.
- xxvii. Grewal, D., Levy, M., & Kumar, V. (2009). Consumer experience management in retailing: An organizing framework. *Journal of Retailing*, 85(1), 1-14.
- xxviii. Grewal, D., Roggeveen, A.L., Sisodia, R., & Nordfält, J. (2017). Enhancing consumer engagement through consciousness. *Journal of Retailing*, 93(1), 55-64.
- xxix. Hilger, J. (2008). The apparel industry in West Europe. *Copenhagen Business School, Department of Intercultural Communication and Management (ICM), Frederiksberg*.
- xxx. Hussain, R., & Ali, M. (2015). Effect of store atmosphere on consumer purchase intention. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, 7(2).
- xxxi. Kotler, P. (1973). Atmospherics as a marketing tool. *Journal of Retailing*, 49(4), 48-64.
- xxxii. Labrecque, L.L., & Milne, G.R. (2012). Exciting red and competent blue: The importance of color in marketing. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 40(5), 711-727.
- xxxiii. Ladhari, R., Gonthier, J., & Lajante, M. (2019). Generation Y and online fashion shopping: Orientations and profiles. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 48, 113-121.
- xxxiv. Lee, B.C.Y. (2007). Consumer attitude toward virtual stores and its correlates. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer services*, 14(3), 182-191.
- xxxv. Luo, X. (2005). How does shopping with others influence impulsive purchasing? *Journal of Consumer Psychology*, 15(4), 288-294.
- xxxvi. Milliman, R.E. (1986). The influence of background music on the behaviour of restaurant patrons. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 13(2), 286-289.
- xxxvii. Nunnally, J.C. (1994). *Psychometric theory* (3rd eds.). Tata McGraw-Hill Education.
- xxxviii. Parment, A. (2013). Generation Y vs. baby boomers: Shopping behavior, buyer involvement and implications for retailing. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 20(2), 189-199.

- xxxix. Parsons, A.G., Ballantine, P.W., Ballantine, P.W., Jack, R., & Parsons, A.G. (2010). Atmospheric cues and their effect on the hedonic retail experience. *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*, 38(8), 641-653.
- xl. Pentecost, R., & Andrews, L. (2010). Fashion retailing and the bottom line: The effects of generational cohorts, gender, fashion fandom, attitudes and impulse buying on fashion expenditure. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 17(1), 43-52.
- xli. Priporas, C.V., Stylos, N., & Fotiadis, A.K. (2017). Generation Z consumers' expectations of interactions in smart retailing: A future agenda. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 77, 374-381.
- xl.ii. Quartier, K., Vanrie, J., & Van Cleempoel, K. (2014). As real as it gets: What role does lighting have on consumer's perception of atmosphere, emotions and behaviour? *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 39, 32-39.
- xl.iii. Rea, M.S. (2000). *The IESNA lighting handbook: Reference & application*. New York.
- xl.iv. Rook, D.W., & Fisher, R.J. (1995). Normative influences on impulsive buying behavior. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 22(3), 305-313.
- xl.v. Schielke, T., & Leudesdorff, M. (2015). Impact of lighting design on brand image for fashion retail stores. *Lighting Research & Technology*, 47(6), 672-692.
- xl.vi. Silva, T. S., & Giraldo, J. D. M. E. (2010). The influence of store image on customer satisfaction: A case study of a shoe store. *Brazilian Business Review*, 7(2), 60-77.
- xl.vii. Spake, D.F., Beatty, S.E., Brockman, B.K., & Crutchfield, T.N. (2003). Consumer comfort in service relationships: Measurement and importance. *Journal of Service Research*, 5(4), 316-332.
- xl.viii. Summers, T.A., & Hebert, P.R. (2001). Shedding some light on store atmospherics: influence of illumination on consumer behavior. *Journal of Business Research*, 54(2), 145-150.
- xl.ix. Turley, L.W., & Milliman, R.E. (2000). Atmospheric effects on shopping behavior: A review of the experimental evidence. *Journal of Business Research*, 49(2), 193-211.
- l. Turley, L.W., & Chebat, J.C. (2002). Linking retail strategy, atmospheric design and shopping behaviour. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 18(1-2), 125-144.
- li. Vrechopoulos, A.P., O'keefe, R.M., Doukidis, G.I., Siomkos, G.J. (2004). Virtual store layout: An experimental comparison in the context of grocery retail. *Journal of Retailing*, 80(1), 13-22.
- lii. Wakefield, K. L., & Baker, J. (1998). Excitement at the mall: Determinants and effects on shopping response. *Journal of Retailing*, 74(4), 515-539.
- liii. Yildirim, K., Akalin-Baskaya, A., & Hidayetoglu, M.L. (2007). Effects of indoor color on mood and cognitive performance. *Building and Environment*, 42(9), 3233-3240.
- liv. Yildirim, K., Hidayetoglu, M.L., & Capanoglu, A. (2011). Effects of interior colors on mood and preference: Comparisons of two living rooms. *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, 112(2), 509-524.